

April 15, 2013

The Honorable Kevin Brady
United States House of Representatives
301 Cannon House Office Building
Washington, DC 20515

The Honorable Mike Thompson
United States House of Representatives
231 Cannon House Office Building
Washington, DC 20515

Dear Congressmen Brady and Thompson:

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments relating to Comprehensive Tax Reform. We are particularly concerned with the impacts of extending the production tax credit for wind energy. Please accept the attached comments endorsed by over 270 residents and property owners of the State of Pennsylvania.

In the final hours of the 2012 fiscal cliff negotiations, the now 20-year old wind production tax credit was again granted a 1-year extension at the estimated cost of \$12 billion¹. This move was done behind closed doors, without debate or opportunity for amendment and with no obligation of Congress to find a way to pay for it.

With this extension, a critical change to the PTC was also introduced that relaxed the eligibility requirements. Wind energy projects now need only 'commence construction' by January 1, 2014 to qualify for the credit. David Burton, partner at Akin Gump Strauss Hauer & Feld, has stated that developers who plan well and bank enough 2013 PTC-eligible component parts, "*may be able to continue to construct PTC-eligible wind farms indefinitely*".² This particular form of regulatory 'gaming' would encumber taxpayers with subsidy obligations for projects that may not go into production for many years after the PTC provision has expired.

While public policy has helped the emerging renewables market, there is a growing realization that the subsidy has outlived its usefulness and may be harmful in its current form^{3,4}. The wind industry insists the PTC is an effective tool to keep electricity rates low. In fact, it is nothing more than a cost imposed on all taxpayers in order to accommodate development of a politically well-connected, high-priced, low-value resource that cannot meet our electric capacity needs.

For the reasons cited in the attached comments, we strongly encourage Congress to let the wind PTC expire. The industry has had ample notice and can take the steps necessary to address the revenue shortfall.

Respectfully,
Laura Jackson

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

¹ The IRS has since increased the PTC to 2.3¢/kWh which puts the extension at nearly \$13 billion.

² North American Windpower, *Post-PTC Extension, Wind Energy Developers Face New Questions*, http://www.nawindpower.com/e107_plugins/content/content.php?content.10917#.UTtZSVec1NQ (Jan 3, 2013).

³ Jenevein, P. *Wind-Power Subsidies? No Thanks*, Wall Street Journal (April 2, 2013) <http://www.windaction.org/opinions/37929>

⁴ Elsberg, P. Spokesperson for Exelon stated "the PTC is no longer needed and distorts competitive wholesale energy markets causing financial harm to other, more reliable clean energy sources." <http://www.governorswindenergycoalition.org/?p=3323>

**U.S. House of Representatives
Committee on Ways and Means
Comprehensive Tax Reform
COMMENTS: ENERGY TAX REFORM WORKING GROUP**

Comments Submitted for the Record - April 15, 2013

The undersigned residents and property owners of the State of Pennsylvania respectfully submit these comments regarding the Energy Production Tax Credit (PTC) for wind energy.

Executive Summary: The PTC is often credited for most of the growth in the wind sector but attributing market activity to the subsidy is overly simplistic and fails to consider other crucial factors driving development. When evaluated against key economic and environment criteria, the cost of the subsidy has proven excessive and the benefits to American taxpayers minimal. If the PTC were to expire, the economics of the industry would shift to States with renewable mandates. Power markets will ultimately confront the real cost of wind energy, and price it accordingly. The overall impact on the industry would be far less severe than proponents claim⁵.

Supporting Statements:

1. **Wind is a mature industry – it's time for it to stand on its own.** The Joint Committee on Taxation reports that between 1992 and 2015⁶, the cumulative cost of the PTC, without extension, will be approximately \$17 billion with the bulk of this claimed by wind resources constructed since 2006. These costs are in addition to the anticipated \$22.6 billion in direct cash outlays under the Section 1603 grant program now expired. Yet, after decades of government support of multiple kinds, the wind industry remains economically unviable.

2. **The wind-sector slow-down is not tied to the end of the PTC.** The wind industry insists it's at risk of a slow-down without the PTC and jobs will be lost. But this view ignores crucial factors driving development in the United States. Demand for wind has eroded, in part, due to states meeting their renewable mandates. Lower natural gas prices have further reduced wind's attractiveness as a 'fuel saver'. Faced with these market conditions, wind developers are tabling projects. The Energy Information Administration⁷ now forecasts flat growth in the wind sector for this decade regardless of what happens with the PTC.

3. **Wind energy is costly, and government efforts to offset the cost distort the markets.** Wholesale power contract prices for onshore wind are roughly two- to three- times the price of more reliable generation, making wind one of the most expensive power sources in the U.S. even after the PTC is factored in. The PTC offsets the high price of wind energy, giving the false impression that wind is competitive with other resources, but at 2.3¢/kWh, the subsidy's pre-tax value (over 3.5¢/kWh) equals, or exceeds the wholesale price of power in much of the country. The size of the subsidy relative to wholesale prices is distorting

⁵ Linowes et.al. 2012 Congressional Testimony <http://science.house.gov/hearing/subcommittee-investigation-and-oversight-subcommittee-energy-and-environment-%E2%80%93-joint-hearing>

⁶ M. Sherlock Testimony, April 2012.
<http://science.house.gov/sites/republicans.science.house.gov/files/documents/hearings/HHRG-112-SY21-WState-MSherlock-20120419.pdf>

⁷ Energy Information Administration. *EIA Reference case for wind energy*, June 2012.
<http://www.eia.gov/oiaf/aeo/tablebrowser/#release=AEO2012&subject=0-AEO2012&table=16-AEO2012®ion=0-0&cases=ref2012-d020112c>

competitive wholesale energy markets and harming the financial integrity of other, more reliable generation⁸.

4. The industry's job-creation claim is based on one-sided, simplistic modeling. The wind industry insists the PTC enables American jobs but ignores potential jobs that would be created given alternative spending of federal funds. Further, industry job forecasts fail to report on the more important *net* job creation. In states like Vermont, government models have shown that above-market energy costs tied to renewables reduce any positive employment impacts of renewable energy capital investment⁹. This is without taking into account additional costs associated with wind-related transmission build-out and grid integration costs associated with wind energy's intermittency.

⁸ Northbridge Group, *Negative Electricity Prices and the Production Tax Credit*. September 2012.
http://www.nbgroup.com/publications/Negative_Electricity_Prices_and_the_Production_Tax_Credit.pdf

⁹ Vermont Department of Public Service, *The Economic Impacts of Vermont Feed in Tariffs*. December 2009.
<http://publicservice.vermont.gov/planning/DPS%20White%20Paper%20Feed%20in%20Tariff.pdf>

Supplemental Sheet

Submitted by:

Laura Jackson

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Date Submitted to the Ways and Means Energy Tax Reform Working Group: April 15, 2013

Comments submitted on behalf of the following residents and property owners of the State of Pennsylvania.

Joan Sampson

[REDACTED]

Frank Piccolella

[REDACTED]

Steve Weston

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Stephen Sampson

[REDACTED]

Ronnie Schenkein, DVM

[REDACTED]

Patty Gamble

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

David W. White

[REDACTED]

Roland Duperron

[REDACTED]

Darrell Gamble

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Sue L. St. John

[REDACTED]

Stash Nawrocki

[REDACTED]

Janine Morley

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Art Kear

[REDACTED]

Helene Nawrocki

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Bryan Morley

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Laurel Kear

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Stacey Howe

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Carol and Ed Szymanik

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Herbert Miller

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Daniel Howe

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

James Petras

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Joan Miller

[REDACTED]

Patricia Valentine

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Myra Petras

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Judi Piccolella

[REDACTED]

Michael Petras

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Colleen Petras

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

David Petras

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Wendy Bastings

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Rick Bonomo

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Dave Bonta

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Marcia Bonta

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Bruce Bonta

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Neal Buterbaugh

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Linda Buterbaugh

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Justin Buterbaugh

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Jill Buterbaugh

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Brian Buterbaugh

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Mary Buterbaugh

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Melinda Buterbaugh

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Joe Casalena

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Richard Coble

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Susan Coble

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Dr. Tom Dick

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Dr. Sally Dick

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Dr. Terence M. Doran

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Bonnie Doran

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Chuck Fleischer

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Gretchen Fleischer

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

John Foor

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Chris Harshberger

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Joan Hartsock

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Joyce Herncane

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Michael Herncane

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Charles A. Hoyer

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Marge Hoyer

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Carrie Kichman

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

John Kichman

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Linda L. Klyne

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Gerald A. Klyne

[REDACTED]

Laura Jackson

[REDACTED]

Michael B. Jackson

[REDACTED]

Ron Johnson

[REDACTED]

Mary Johnson

[REDACTED]

Alice Kotala, M.D.

[REDACTED]

Stan Kotala, M.D.,

[REDACTED]

Elisabeth Kotala

[REDACTED]

Helena Kotala

[REDACTED]

Janis Kucas

[REDACTED]

Phil Kucas

[REDACTED]

Stephen Main

[REDACTED]

Sarah Miles

[REDACTED]

Gary A. Miller

[REDACTED]

Jack Monsour

[REDACTED]

Kathy Monsour

[REDACTED]

Burton Monsour

[REDACTED]

Jackson Monsour

[REDACTED]

Christy Monsour

[REDACTED]

Anne Pratt

[REDACTED]

Sam Pratt

[REDACTED]

George Radeschi

[REDACTED]

Loretta Radeschi

[REDACTED]

Brian Schoffstall

[REDACTED]

Alana Schoffstall

[REDACTED]

Karin Sedewar

[REDACTED]

John Sedewar

[REDACTED]

Bette Slayton

[REDACTED]

Paul Slayton

[REDACTED]

Deb Tencer

[REDACTED]

Ben G. Tresselt, Jr.

[REDACTED]

Pete Weaver

[REDACTED]

Bill Zemaitis

[REDACTED]

Jo Ann Ziegler

[REDACTED]

Phil Ziegler

[REDACTED]

Alison Buchan

[REDACTED]

Jack Buchan

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Lindsay Buchan

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Tami Buchan

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

John Andrews

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Melissa Andrews

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Agnes T. Cominsky

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Denise Cominsky

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Joe Cominsky

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

John G. Cominsky

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Joseph A. Cominsky

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Dennis M. McNair, PhD

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Karen L. McNair

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

John Paulovich

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Gloria Jean Cominsky

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Kim Moore

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Bo Moore

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Roddy Acker

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Verlee Acker

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Warren Baker

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Ruby Becker

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Kate Bollman

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Susan Braun

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Brent Chippendale

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Jan Chippendale

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Ruth Davis

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Alice Fleischer

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Alan Foor

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Debra Foor

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Barry Haver

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Sally Haver

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Vicky McConahy

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Joyce Mengel

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

John Shaffer

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Annette Thaler



Patty Burkey



Scott Yetter



Horace Thaler



Wanetta Escherich



Judy Yetter



Mary Lou Pelin



Rosemary McGlynn



Cindy Pratt



Deborah Bodenschatz



Joe Carrier



Merri Lynn Craig



Joe Campbell



Barb Carrier



Ben Craig



Wendy Campbell



James Richey



Joe Arcuri



Joe Chipoletti



Kim Van Fleet



Kathy Arcuri



Janet Deitle



Glen Van Fleet



Mr. & Mrs. Joseph Boylan



Dave Escherich



Harry Hunt



Tom Palewicz



Dick Akers



Thomas Wasilewski



Deb Palewicz



Joe Emerick



Glenn Czulada



Jim Ropvito



Sue Ropvito



Michael J. Cuthie



Mr. & Mrs. William G. Price, Sr.



John Whitcomb



John Anthony



Mr. & Mrs. William G. Price, Jr.



Virginia Whitcomb



Janice Anthony



Lisa Hepler



Melvin Mastishin



Mr. & Mrs. John Briel



Mr. & Mrs. Paul Capparell



Eleanor Mastishin



Andrew Smith



Paul Dean



Donna Griffiths



Kathy Smith



Beth Dean



Bob Griffiths



Bill Mehlbaum



Jack Irvin



Derek R. Griffiths



Chris Mehlbaum



Sue Irvin



Cheryl Ann Cuthie



Brenda Staller



Mr. and Mrs. John F. Burke



Vincent Cuthie



Edward Staller



Mr. & Mrs. Joseph Halko



Mary M. Cuthie



Melissa Caruso



Janice Burke



Kathy Halko

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Lisa Troutman

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Linda Brown

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

William Halko

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Mr. & Mrs. Ed Loftus

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Michael Evans

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Jennifer Burke

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Mr. & Mrs. Joseph Halko

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Mr. & Mrs. James W. Fetterolf

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Joseph Menne

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Marc Burlile

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Mr. & Mrs. Robert May

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Crystal Fetterolf

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Beth Burlile

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Eli Long

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Emma Fetterolf

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Dan Paul

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Helen Thomas

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Mr. & Mrs. Louis Marshall

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Jane Paul

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

John Hadesty

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Joseph Ferrari

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Eve Bauser

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

William Kehler

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Tim Gunn

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Tom Malloy

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Rick Mills

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Mr. & Mrs. Robert Opie

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Mr. & Mrs. Thomas Sosar

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Rose Mills

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Mr. & Mrs. Kenneth Wagner

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Dave Brown

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Irene Morgan

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

James Price



Pam Hershberger



Joe Jordan



Dr. Joseph Weber



Barry Harshberger



Joseph Kleeman



Judy Weber



Paul Burroughs



Joan Moyer



Jim Rovito



Sheila Doran-Benyon



George Moyer



Nicholas Herncane



James Whitcomb



John Whitcomb



Mike Shaffer



Don Maurer



Melvin Mastishin



John Herman



Becky Jordan



Denise Mastishin



Richard Hershberger



Janet Kuehl



Dallas Foor



Ronald N. Intrieri



John Parrott



Nina Palmer



Dennis Pagen



Roxanne Parrott



Tom Kuehl



Sandra Herman



